



Equivalence of critical and subcritical sharp Trudinger–Moser–Adams inequalities

Nguyen Lam, Guozhen Lu and Lu Zhang

Abstract. Sharp Trudinger–Moser inequalities on the first order Sobolev spaces and their analogous Adams inequalities on high order Sobolev spaces play an important role in geometric analysis, partial differential equations and other branches of modern mathematics. Such geometric inequalities have been studied extensively by many authors in recent years and there is a vast literature. There are two types of such optimal inequalities: critical and subcritical sharp inequalities, both are with best constants. Critical sharp inequalities are under the restriction of the full Sobolev norms for the functions under consideration, while the subcritical inequalities are under the restriction of the partial Sobolev norms for the functions under consideration. There are subtle differences between these two type of inequalities. Surprisingly, we prove in this paper that these critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser and Adams inequalities are actually equivalent. Moreover, we also establish the asymptotic behavior of the supremum for the subcritical Trudinger–Moser and Adams inequalities on the entire Euclidean spaces, and provide a precise relationship between the suprema for the critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser and Adams inequalities. This relationship of supremum is useful in establishing the existence and nonexistence of extremal functions for the Trudinger–Moser inequalities. Since the critical Trudinger–Moser and Adams inequalities can be easier to prove than subcritical ones in some occasions, and more difficult to establish in other occasions, our results and the method suggest a new approach to both the critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser and Adams type inequalities.

1. Introduction

In this section, we will begin with giving an overview of the state of affairs of the best constants for sharp Trudinger and Adams inequalities. Subsection 1.1

Mathematics Subject Classification (2010): 46E30, 42B35, 46E35, 42B37.

Keywords: Trudinger–Moser–Adams inequalities, critical and subcritical inequalities, best constants, equivalence, supremum, level sets, local to global argument.

concerns the sharp Trudinger–Moser inequalities, and Subsection 1.2 discusses the sharp Adams inequalities involving high order derivatives. In Subsection 1.3, we will state our main results on the equivalence between critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser and Adams inequalities.

1.1. Trudinger–Moser inequality

Motivated by the applications to the prescribed Gauss curvature problem on two dimensional sphere \mathbb{S}^2 , J. Moser proved in [33] an exponential type inequality on \mathbb{S}^2 with an optimal constant. A sharp form of such an inequality on high dimensional sphere was established by W. Beckner [3]. The important relationship between the higher-dimensional Moser–Onofri inequality and the problem of prescribing Q-curvature and the zeta functional determinants on the high dimensional Riemannian manifolds has been explored extensively in the work of Paneitz [34], Branson, Chang, and Yang [4], Chang and Yang [10], and Chang, Gursky, and Yang [7], Chang and Qing [8], [9], Djadli and Malchiodi [14], Wei and Xu [43], etc. We refer to Chang and Yang [11], [12], and also Lam and Lu [18], for extensive accounts and many references in this direction.

In the same paper of Moser [33], he sharpened an inequality on any bounded domain Ω in the Euclidean space \mathbb{R}^N studied independently by Pohozaev [35], Trudinger [42] and Yudovich [17], namely the embedding $W_0^{1,N}(\Omega) \subset L_{\varphi_N}(\Omega)$, where $L_{\varphi_N}(\Omega)$ is the Orlicz space associated with the Young function $\varphi_N(t) = \exp(\alpha|t|^{N/(N-1)}) - 1$ for some $\alpha > 0$. More precisely, using the Schwarz rearrangement, Moser proved the following inequality in [33]:

Theorem A. *Let Ω be a domain with finite measure in the Euclidean N -space \mathbb{R}^N , $N \geq 2$. Then there exists a constant $\alpha_N > 0$, such that*

$$(1.1) \quad \frac{1}{|\Omega|} \int_{\Omega} \exp(\alpha_N |u|^{N/(N-1)}) \, dx \leq c_0$$

for any $u \in W_0^{1,N}(\Omega)$ with $\int_{\Omega} |\nabla u|^N \, dx \leq 1$. The constant $\alpha_N = \omega_{N-1}^{1/(N-1)}$, where ω_{N-1} is the area of the surface of the unit N -ball, is optimal in the sense that if we replace α_N by any number $\alpha > \alpha_N$, then the above inequality can no longer hold with some c_0 independent of u .

Moser used the following symmetrization argument: every function u is associated to a radially symmetric function u^* such that the sublevel-sets of u^* are balls with the same area as the corresponding sublevel-sets of u . Moreover, u is a positive and non-increasing function defined on $B_R(0)$ where $|B_R(0)| = |\Omega|$. Hence, by the layer cake representation, we can have that

$$\int_{\Omega} f(u) \, dx = \int_{B_R(0)} f(u^*) \, dx$$

for any function f that is the difference of two monotone functions. In particular,

we obtain

$$\|u\|_p = \|u^*\|_p \quad \text{and} \quad \int_{\Omega} \exp(\alpha|u|^{N/(N-1)}) \, dx = \int_{B_R(0)} \exp(\alpha|u^*|^{N/(N-1)}) \, dx.$$

Moreover, the well-known Pólya–Szegő inequality

$$(1.2) \quad \int_{B_R(0)} |\nabla u^*|^p \, dx \leq \int_{\Omega} |\nabla u|^p \, dx$$

plays a crucial role in the approach of J. Moser.

As far as the existence of extremal functions of Moser’s inequality is concerned, the first breakthrough was due to the celebrated work of Carleson and Chang [5] in which they proved that the supremum

$$\sup_{u \in W_0^{1,N}(\Omega), \int_{\Omega} |\nabla u|^N \, dx \leq 1} \frac{1}{|\Omega|} \int_{\Omega} \exp(\alpha_N |u|^{N/(N-1)}) \, dx$$

can be achieved when Ω is an Euclidean ball. This result came as a surprise because it was known that the Sobolev inequality does not have extremal functions supported on any finite ball. Subsequently, existence of extremal functions has been established on arbitrary domains in [15], [29], and on Riemannian manifolds in [25], etc.

We note when the volume of Ω is infinite, the Trudinger–Moser inequality (1.1) becomes meaningless. Thus, it becomes interesting and nontrivial to extend such inequalities to unbounded domains. Here we state the following two such results in the Euclidean spaces.

We first recall the subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequality in the Euclidean spaces established by Adachi and Tanaka [1].

Theorem B. *For any $\alpha < \alpha_N$, there exists a positive constant $C_{N,\alpha}$ such that $\forall u \in W^{1,N}(\mathbb{R}^N)$, $\|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1$:*

$$(1.3) \quad \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha|u|^{N/(N-1)}) \, dx \leq C_{N,\alpha} \|u\|_N^N,$$

where

$$\phi_N(t) = e^t - \sum_{j=0}^{N-2} \frac{t^j}{j!}.$$

The constant α_N is sharp in the sense that the supremum is infinity when $\alpha \geq \alpha_N$.

We note that in the above theorem we only impose the restriction on the norm $\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |\nabla u|^N$, without restricting the full norm

$$\left[\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |\nabla u|^N + \tau \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |u|^N \right]^{1/N} \leq 1.$$

The method in [1] requires a symmetrization argument which is not available in many other non-Euclidean settings. The above inequality fails at the critical case $\alpha = \alpha_N$. So it is natural to ask when the above can be true when $\alpha = \alpha_N$. This was done by Ruf [36] and Li and Ruf [28] by using the restriction of the full norm of the Sobolev space $W^{1,N}(\mathbb{R}^N)$: $[\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |\nabla u|^N + \tau \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |u|^N]^{1/N}$.

Theorem C. *For all $0 \leq \alpha \leq \alpha_N$:*

$$(1.4) \quad \sup_{\|u\| \leq 1} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha|u|^{N/(N-1)}) dx < \infty$$

where

$$\|u\| = \left(\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} (|\nabla u|^N + |u|^N) dx \right)^{1/N}.$$

Moreover, this constant α_N is sharp in the sense that if $\alpha > \alpha_N$, then the supremum is infinity.

Sharp critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequalities on infinite volume domains of the Heisenberg groups were also established in [21], [23] by using a symmetrization-free method which leads local inequalities to global ones.

The inequality (1.3) uses the seminorm $\|\nabla u\|_N$ and hence fails at the critical case $\alpha = \alpha_N$, the best constant. Thus, it can be considered as a sharp subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequality. In (1.4), when using the full norm of $W^{1,N}(\mathbb{R}^N)$, the best constant could be attained. Namely, the inequality holds at the critical case $\alpha = \alpha_N$. Hence, (1.4) is the sharp critical Trudinger–Moser inequality.

Nevertheless, the main purpose of this paper is to show that in fact, these two versions of critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser type inequalities are indeed equivalent. Since the critical Trudinger–Moser type inequality is easier to study than the subcritical one in some occasions, and it is easier to investigate subcritical Trudinger–Moser type inequality than the critical one in other occasions, our paper suggests a new approach to both the critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser type inequalities.

1.2. Adams inequalities

It is worthy noting that symmetrization has been a very useful and efficient (and almost inevitable) method when dealing with the sharp geometric inequalities. Thus, it is very fascinating to investigate such sharp geometric inequalities, in particular, the Trudinger–Moser type inequalities, in the settings where the symmetrization is not available such as on the higher order Sobolev spaces, the Heisenberg groups, Riemannian manifolds, sub-Riemannian manifolds, etc. Indeed, in these settings, an inequality like (1.2) is not available. In these situations, the first break-through came from the work of D. Adams [2], when he attempted to set up the Trudinger–Moser inequality in the higher order setting in Euclidean spaces. In fact, using that one can write a smooth function as a convolution of a (Riesz) potential with its derivatives, and then one can use the symmetrization for this convolution, instead

of the symmetrization of the higher order derivatives, Adams proved the following inequality with boundary Dirichlet condition [2], which was extended to the Navier boundary condition in [39] when $\beta = 0$, and then by the first two authors to the case $0 \leq \beta < N$ [20]. The following is taken from [20].

Theorem D. *Let Ω be an open and bounded set in R^N with $0 \in \Omega$. If m is a positive integer less than N , $0 \leq \beta < N$, then there exists a constant $C_0 = C(N, m, \beta) > 0$ such that for any $u \in W_N^{m, N/m}(\Omega)$ and $\|\nabla^m u\|_{L^{N/m}(\Omega)} \leq 1$, then*

$$\frac{1}{|\Omega|^{1-\beta/N}} \int_{\Omega} \exp(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u(x)|^{N/(N-m)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^{\beta}} \leq C_0$$

for all $\alpha \leq \alpha(N, m)$, where

$$\alpha(N, m) = \begin{cases} \frac{N}{\omega_{N-1}} \left[\frac{\pi^{N/2} 2^m \Gamma(\frac{m+1}{2})}{\Gamma(\frac{N-m+1}{2})} \right]^{N/(N-m)} & \text{when } m \text{ is odd} \\ \frac{N}{\omega_{N-1}} \left[\frac{\pi^{N/2} 2^m \Gamma(\frac{m}{2})}{\Gamma(\frac{N-m}{2})} \right]^{N/(N-m)} & \text{when } m \text{ is even} \end{cases}.$$

Furthermore, the constant $\alpha(N, m)$ is optimal in the sense that, for any $\alpha > \alpha(N, m)$, the integral can be made as large as possible.

In Theorem D, we use the symbol $\nabla^m u$, m a positive integer, to denote the m -th order gradient for $u \in C^m$, the class of m -th order differentiable functions:

$$\nabla^m u = \begin{cases} \Delta^{m/2} u & \text{for } m \text{ even,} \\ \nabla \Delta^{(m-1)/2} u & \text{for } m \text{ odd.} \end{cases}$$

where ∇ is the usual gradient operator and Δ is the Laplacian. Also, $W_N^{m, N/m}(\Omega)$ is the Sobolev space with homogeneous Navier boundary conditions:

$$W_N^{m, N/m}(\Omega) := \{u \in W^{m, N/m}(\Omega) : \Delta^j u = 0 \text{ on } \partial\Omega \text{ for } 0 \leq j \leq [\frac{m-1}{2}]\}.$$

Notice that $W_N^{m, N/m}(\Omega)$ contains the Sobolev space $W_0^{m, N/m}(\Omega)$ as a closed subspace.

Adams inequalities have been extended to compact Riemannian manifolds in [16]. In another direction, Trudinger–Moser type inequality has been established by Tian and Zhu [41] for almost plurisubharmonic functions on any Kahler–Einstein manifolds with positive scalar curvature which generalizes the stronger version of the Moser–Onofri inequality on S^2 and also refines a weaker inequality found earlier in [40]. The Adams inequalities with optimal constants for high order derivatives on domains of infinite volume were recently established by Ruf and Sani in [37] in the case of even order derivatives and by Lam and Lu for all order of derivatives including fractional orders [19], [22]. The idea of [37] is to use the comparison principle for polyharmonic equations (thus could deal with the case of even order of derivatives) and thus involves some difficult construction of auxiliary functions. The argument in [22] uses the representation of the Bessel potentials and thus avoids dealing with such a comparison principle. In particular, the

method developed in [22] adapts the idea of deriving the sharp Trudinger–Moser–Adams inequalities on domains of finite measure to the entire spaces using the level sets of the functions under consideration. Thus, this local to global argument in [22] does not use the symmetrization method and thus also works for Lorentz–Sobolev spaces [31], hyperbolic spaces [30] and Riemannian manifolds [26], the sub-Riemannian setting such as the Heisenberg groups [21], [23] which extends the sharp Trudinger–Moser inequalities on finite domains in the Heisenberg group [13], etc. The following general version is taken from [22].

Theorem (Lam–Lu, 2013). *Let $0 < \gamma < N$ be an arbitrary real positive number, $p = N/\gamma$, $p' = p/(p - 1)$, and $\tau > 0$. There holds*

$$\sup_{u \in W^{\gamma,p}(\mathbb{R}^N), \|(\tau I - \Delta)^{\gamma/2} u\|_p \leq 1} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi(\beta_0(N, \gamma)|u|^{p'}) dx < \infty,$$

where

$$\phi(t) = e^t - \sum_{j=0}^{j_p-2} \frac{t^j}{j!}, \quad \text{with } j_p = \min\{j \in \mathbb{N} : j \geq p\} \geq p,$$

$$\beta_0(N, \gamma) = \frac{N}{\omega_{N-1}} \left[\frac{\pi^{N/2} 2^\gamma \Gamma(\gamma/2)}{\Gamma((N - \gamma)/2)} \right]^{p'}.$$

Furthermore, this inequality is sharp in the sense that if $\beta_0(N, \gamma)$ is replaced by any $\beta > \beta_0(N, \gamma)$, then the supremum is infinite.

Here $W^{\gamma,p}(\mathbb{R}^N)$ is the fractional Sobolev space defined by the Bessel potential (see [38]). It is well-known that when $\gamma \in \mathbb{N}$, $W^{\gamma,p}(\mathbb{R}^N)$ is equivalent to the scale of the regular Sobolev space defined in the distribution sense. Now, for $\tau > 0$, $\alpha \geq 0$, we define the operator $L_{\tau,\alpha}(x)$ by

$$L_{\tau,\alpha}(x) = \tau^{(N-\alpha)/2} \frac{1}{(4\pi)^{\alpha/2}} \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha/2)} \int_0^\infty e^{-\pi\tau|x|^2/\delta} e^{-\delta/4\pi} \delta^{(-N+\alpha)/2} \frac{d\delta}{\delta}.$$

We notice that $L_{1,\alpha}$ is the well-known Bessel potential. For $u \in W^{\gamma,p}(\mathbb{R}^N)$, we define $f = (\tau I - \Delta)^{\gamma/2} u \in L^p(\mathbb{R}^N)$ if and only if $u = L_{1,\alpha} * f$.

Very little is known about the existence of extremals for Adams inequalities. Existence of extremal functions for the Adams inequality on bounded domains in Euclidean spaces has been established in [32] and compact Riemannian manifolds by [27] only when $N = 4$ and $m = 2$ and is still widely open in other cases.

1.3. Our main results

Though the Adachi–Tanaka type inequality in unbounded domains has been known for quite some time, it is still not known what the following supremum is:

$$\sup_{\|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1} \frac{1}{\|u\|_N^{N-\beta}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta}.$$

In particular, we do not even know how the supremum behaves asymptotically when α goes to α_N .

The following theorem answers this question and provides the lower and upper bounds asymptotically for the supremum.

Theorem 1.1. *Let $N \geq 2$ and define $\alpha_N = N\left(\frac{N\pi^{N/2}}{\Gamma(N/2+1)}\right)^{1/(N-1)}$. Let $0 \leq \beta < N$ and $0 \leq \alpha < \alpha_N$. Denote*

$$\text{AT}(\alpha, \beta) = \sup_{\|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1} \frac{1}{\|u\|_N^{N-\beta}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta}.$$

Then there exist positive constants $c = c(N, \beta)$ and $C = C(N, \beta)$ such that, when α is close enough to α_N ,

$$(1.5) \quad \frac{c(N, \beta)}{(1 - (\alpha/\alpha_N)^{N-1})^{(N-\beta)/N}} \leq \text{AT}(\alpha, \beta) \leq \frac{C(N, \beta)}{(1 - (\alpha/\alpha_N)^{N-1})^{(N-\beta)/N}}.$$

Moreover, the constant α_N is sharp in the sense that $\text{AT}(\alpha_N, \beta) = \infty$.

We note that we do not assume a priori the validity of the critical Trudinger–Moser inequality with the restriction on the full norm (i.e., the inequality (1.4)) in order to derive the above asymptotic behavior of the supremum $\text{AT}(\alpha, \beta)$. We also mention that the upper bound in (1.5) in dimension two in the nonsingular case $\beta = 0$ has also been given in [6] using the sharp critical Trudinger–Moser inequality in \mathbb{R}^2 .

Next, we like to know how the supremum $\text{AT}(\alpha, \beta)$ we established in Theorem 1.1 will provide a proof to the sharp critical Trudinger–Moser inequality. Thus, this gives a new proof of the sharp critical Trudinger–Moser inequality in all dimensions N . We also answer the question for which a and b the critical Trudinger–Moser inequality holds under the restriction on the full norm $\|\nabla u\|_N^a + \|u\|_N^b \leq 1$. Moreover, we establish the precise relationship between the suprema for the critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequalities.

Theorem 1.2. *Let $N \geq 2$, $0 \leq \beta < N$, $0 < a, b$. Denote*

$$\text{MT}_{a,b}(\beta) = \sup_{\|\nabla u\|_N^a + \|u\|_N^b \leq 1} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha_N(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta};$$

$$\text{MT}(\beta) = \text{MT}_{N,N}(\beta).$$

Then $\text{MT}_{a,b}(\beta) < \infty$ if and only if $b \leq N$. The constant α_N is sharp. Moreover, we have the following identity:

$$(1.6) \quad \text{MT}_{a,b}(\beta) = \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha_N)} \left(\frac{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}}{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{\frac{N-1}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}} \text{AT}(\alpha, \beta).$$

In particular, $\text{MT}(\beta) < \infty$ and

$$\text{MT}(\beta) = \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha_N)} \left(\frac{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{N-1}}{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{N-1}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{N}} \text{AT}(\alpha, \beta).$$

This relationship between the suprema for the critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequalities has played an important role in establishing the existence and nonexistence of extremal functions for Trudinger–Moser inequalities on the entire spaces [24].

We now consider the sharp subcritical and critical Adams inequalities on $W^{2,N/2}(\mathbb{R}^N)$, $N \geq 3$. Our first result is the following sharp subcritical Adams inequality which provides the asymptotic behavior of the supremum (lower and upper bounds) in this case.

Theorem 1.3. *Let $N \geq 3$, $0 \leq \beta < N$ and $0 \leq \alpha < \alpha(N, 2)$. Denote*

$$\text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta) = \sup_{\|\Delta u\|_{N/2} \leq 1} \frac{1}{\|u\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx;$$

$$\phi_{N,2}(t) = \sum_{j \in \mathbb{N}: j \geq (N-2)/2} \frac{t^j}{j!}.$$

Then there exist positive constants $c = c(N, \beta)$ and $C = C(N, \beta)$ such that when α is close enough to $\alpha(N, 2)$:

$$(1.7) \quad \frac{c(N, \beta)}{\left[1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{(N-2)/2}\right]^{1-\beta/N}} \leq \text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta) \leq \frac{C(N, \beta)}{\left[1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{(N-2)/2}\right]^{1-\beta/N}}.$$

Moreover, the constant $\alpha(N, 2)$ is sharp in the sense that $\text{ATA}(\alpha(N, 2), \beta) = \infty$.

The next theorem offers a precise relationship between the suprema of critical and subcritical Adams inequalities. Thus, it also provides a new approach of proving one of the critical and subcritical Adams inequalities from the other.

Theorem 1.4. *Let $N \geq 3$, $0 \leq \beta < N$, $0 < a, b$. We denote:*

$$A_{a,b}(\beta) = \sup_{\|\Delta u\|_{N/2}^a + \|u\|_{N/2}^b \leq 1} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(N, 2)(1-\beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx;$$

$$A_{N/2,N/2}(\beta) = A(\beta);$$

Then $A_{a,b}(\beta) < \infty$ if and only if $b \leq N/2$. The constant $\alpha(N, 2)$ is sharp. Moreover, we have the following identity:

$$(1.8) \quad A_{a,b}(\beta) = \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha(N,2))} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}} \text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta).$$

In particular, $A(\beta) < \infty$ and

$$A(\beta) = \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha(N,2))} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{2}}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{2}}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{N}} \text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta).$$

Finally, we will study the following improved sharp critical Adams inequality under the assumption that a version of the sharp subcritical Adams inequality holds for the fractional order derivatives.

Theorem 1.5. *Let $0 < \gamma < N$ be an arbitrary real positive number, $p = N/\gamma$, $0 \leq \alpha < \beta_0(N, \gamma) = \frac{N}{\omega_{N-1}} \left[\frac{\pi^{N/2} 2^\gamma \Gamma(\gamma/2)}{\Gamma((N-\gamma)/2)} \right]^{p/(p-1)}$, $0 \leq \beta < N$, $0 < a, b$. We denote*

$$\begin{aligned} \text{GATA}(\alpha, \beta) &= \sup_{\substack{\|(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2} u\|_p \leq 1 \\ u \in W^{\gamma,p}(\mathbb{R}^N)}} \frac{1}{\|u\|_p^{p(1-\beta/N)}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,\gamma}(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|u|^{p/(p-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx; \\ \text{GA}_{a,b}(\beta) &= \sup_{\substack{\|(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2} u\|_p^a + \|u\|_p^b \leq 1 \\ u \in W^{\gamma,p}(\mathbb{R}^N)}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,\gamma}(\beta_0(N, \gamma)(1-\beta/N)|u|^{p/(p-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \end{aligned}$$

where

$$\phi_{N,\gamma}(t) = \sum_{j \in \mathbb{N}: j \geq p-1} \frac{t^j}{j!}.$$

Assume that $\text{GATA}(\alpha, \beta) < \infty$ and that there exists a constant $C(N, \gamma, \beta) > 0$ such that

$$(1.9) \quad \text{GATA}(\alpha, \beta) \leq \frac{C(N, \gamma, \beta)}{\left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\beta_0(N, \gamma)}\right)^{(p-1)/p}\right)}$$

Then when $b \leq p$, we have $\text{GA}_{a,b}(\beta) < \infty$. In particular $\text{GA}_{p,p}(\beta) < \infty$.

Though we have to assume a sharp subcritical Adams inequality (1.9), the main idea of Theorem 1.5 is that since $\text{GATA}(\alpha, \beta)$ is actually subcritical, i.e. α is strictly less than the critical level $\beta_0(N, \gamma)$, it is easier to study than $\text{GA}_{a,b}(\beta)$. Hence, it suggests a new approach in the study of $\text{GA}_{a,b}(\beta)$.

2. Some lemmata

Lemma 2.1.

$$\text{AT}(\alpha, \beta) = \sup_{\|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1; \|u\|_N = 1} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx.$$

Proof. For any $u \in W^{1,N}(\mathbb{R}^N) : \|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1$, we define

$$v(x) = u(\lambda x), \quad \lambda = \|u\|_N.$$

Then, $\nabla v(x) = \lambda \nabla u(\lambda x)$, hence

$$\|\nabla v\|_N = \|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1; \quad \|v\|_N = 1,$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|v(x)|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|u(\lambda x)|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ &= \frac{1}{\lambda^{N-\beta}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|u(\lambda x)|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{d(\lambda x)}{|\lambda x|^\beta} \\ &= \frac{1}{\|u\|_N^{N-\beta}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta}. \quad \square \end{aligned}$$

By Lemma 2.1, we can always assume $\|u\|_N = 1$ in the sharp subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequality.

Lemma 2.2. *The sharp subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequality is a consequence of the sharp critical Trudinger–Moser inequality. More precisely, if $MT_{a,b}(\beta)$ is finite, then $AT(\alpha, \beta)$ is finite. Moreover,*

$$(2.1) \quad AT(\alpha, \beta) \leq \left(\frac{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}b}}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}} MT_{a,b}(\beta).$$

In particular,

$$AT(\alpha, \beta) \leq \left(\frac{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}} \right)^{1-\beta/N} MT(\beta).$$

Proof. Let $u \in W^{1,N}(\mathbb{R}^N) : \|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1; \|u\|_N = 1$. Set

$$v(x) = \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}} u(\lambda x), \quad \text{with } \lambda = \left(\frac{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}b}}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}} \right)^{1/b}.$$

then

$$\begin{aligned} \|\nabla v\|_N^a &= \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a} \|\nabla u\|_N^a \leq \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a} \\ \|v\|_N^b &= \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}b} \frac{1}{\lambda^b} \|u\|_N^b = 1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}. \end{aligned}$$

Hence $\|\nabla v\|_N^a + \|v\|_N^b \leq 1$. By the definition of $MT_{a,b}(\beta)$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{\frac{N}{N-1}}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u(\lambda x)|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{d(\lambda x)}{|\lambda x|^\beta} \\ &= \lambda^{N-\beta} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha_N(1 - \beta/N)|v|^{\frac{N}{N-1}}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \leq \left(\frac{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}b}}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}} MT_{a,b}(\beta). \end{aligned}$$

□

Lemma 2.3.

$$ATA(\alpha, \beta) = \sup_{\|\Delta u\|_{N/2} \leq 1; \|u\|_{N/2} = 1} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx.$$

Proof. Let $u \in W^{2,N/2}(\mathbb{R}^N) : \|\Delta u\|_{N/2} \leq 1$ and set

$$v(x) = u(\lambda x); \quad \text{with } \lambda = \|u\|_{N/2}^{1/2}$$

Then it is easy to check that

$$\Delta v(x) = \lambda^2 \Delta u(\lambda x)$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \|\Delta v\|_{N/2} &= \|\Delta u\|_{N/2}; \\ \|v\|_{N/2}^{N/2} &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |v(x)|^{N/2} dx = \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |u(\lambda x)|^{N/2} dx = \frac{1}{\lambda^N} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |u(x)|^{N/2} dx = 1. \end{aligned}$$

Moreover,

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|v|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u(\lambda x)|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &= \frac{1}{\lambda^{N-\beta}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u(x)|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &= \frac{1}{\|u\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx. \end{aligned}$$

□

Lemma 2.4. *Assume $A_{a,b}(\beta) < \infty$, then $ATA(\alpha, \beta) < \infty$. Moreover,*

$$(2.2) \quad ATA(\alpha, \beta) \leq \left(\frac{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)})^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}}{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)})^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}} A_{a,b}(\beta).$$

In particular, if $A(\beta) < \infty$, then

$$ATA(\alpha, \beta) \leq \left(\frac{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)})^{\frac{N-2}{2}}}{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)})^{\frac{N-2}{2}}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{N}} A(\beta).$$

Proof. Let $u \in W^{2,N/2}(\mathbb{R}^N) : \|\Delta u\|_{N/2} \leq 1$ and $\|u\|_{N/2} = 1$. We define

$$v(x) = \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}} u(\lambda x), \quad \text{with } \lambda = \left(\frac{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)})^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}}{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)})^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}\right)^{\frac{1}{2b}}.$$

then

$$\begin{aligned} \|\Delta v\|_{N/2} &= \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}} \|\Delta u\|_{N/2} \leq \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}} \\ \|v\|_{N/2}^b &= \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}b} \frac{1}{\lambda^{2b}} \|u\|_{N/2}^b = 1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}. \end{aligned}$$

Hence $\|\Delta v\|_{N/2}^a + \|v\|_{N/2}^b \leq 1$. By the definition of $A_{a,b}(\beta)$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_{N,2}\left(\alpha\left(1 - \frac{\beta}{N}\right)|u|^{N/(N-2)}\right) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_{N,2}\left(\alpha\left(1 - \frac{\beta}{N}\right)|u(\lambda x)|^{N/(N-2)}\right) \frac{d(\lambda x)}{|\lambda x|^\beta} \\ &= \lambda^{N-\beta} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_{N,2}\left(\alpha_N\left(1 - \frac{\beta}{N}\right)|v|^{N/(N-2)}\right) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ &\leq \left(\frac{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)})^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}}{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)})^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}\right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}} A_{a,b}(\beta). \end{aligned}$$

□

3. Asymptotic behavior of the suprema in subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequalities and relationship with the critical suprema

In this section, we will prove the improved sharp subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequality. In particular, we will establish the asymptotic behavior for the supremum $AT(\alpha, \beta)$ for the subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequality (Theorem 1.1). We would like to note here that we don't assume the critical $MT(\beta) < \infty$ in the proof of Theorem 1.1. Moreover, we also establish the relationship between the suprema $AT(\alpha, \beta)$ and $MT(\beta)$ of the critical and subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequalities (Theorem 1.2).

Proof of Theorem 1.1. Suppose that $u \in C_0^\infty(\mathbb{R}^N) \setminus \{0\}$, $u \geq 0$, $\|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1$ and $\|u\|_N = 1$. Let

$$\Omega = \left\{x : u(x) > \left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}\right)^{1/N}\right\}.$$

Then the volume of Ω can be estimated as follows:

$$|\Omega| = \int_{\Omega} 1 dx \leq \int_{\Omega} \frac{u(x)^N}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}} dx \leq \frac{1}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}}.$$

We have

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N \setminus \Omega} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx &\leq \int_{\{u \leq 1\}} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha|u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq e^\alpha \int_{\{u \leq 1\}} \frac{u^N}{|x|^\beta} dx \leq e^\alpha \int_{\{u \leq 1; |x| \geq 1\}} \frac{u^N}{|x|^\beta} dx + e^\alpha \int_{\{u \leq 1; |x| < 1\}} \frac{u^N}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq \frac{C(N, \beta)}{\left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}\right)^{(N-\beta)/N}}. \end{aligned}$$

Now, consider

$$I = \int_{\Omega} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \leq \int_{\Omega} \frac{\exp(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx.$$

On Ω , we set

$$v(x) = u(x) - \left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}\right)^{1/N}.$$

Then it is clear that $v \in W_0^{1,N}(\Omega)$ and $\|\nabla v\|_N \leq 1$. Also, on Ω , with $\varepsilon = \alpha_N/\alpha - 1$,

$$\begin{aligned} |u|^{N/(N-1)} &\leq (|v| + \left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}\right)^{1/N})^{N/(N-1)} \\ &\leq (1 + \varepsilon)|v|^{N/(N-1)} + \left(1 - \frac{1}{(1 + \varepsilon)^{N-1}}\right)^{\frac{1}{1-N}} \left|\left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}\right)^{1/N}\right|^{N/(N-1)} \\ &= \frac{\alpha_N}{\alpha} |v|^{N/(N-1)} + 1. \end{aligned}$$

Hence, by the Trudinger–Moser inequality on bounded domains,

$$\begin{aligned}
 I &\leq \int_{\Omega} \frac{\exp(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \leq \int_{\Omega} \frac{\exp(\alpha_N(1-\beta/N)|v|^{N/(N-1)} + \alpha)}{|x|^\beta} dx \\
 &\leq C(N, \beta) |\Omega|^{1-\beta/N} \leq \frac{C(N, \beta)}{(1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{N-1})^{(N-\beta)/N}}.
 \end{aligned}$$

In conclusion, we have

$$\text{AT}(\alpha, \beta) \leq \frac{C(N, \beta)}{(1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{N-1})^{(N-\beta)/N}}.$$

Next, we will show that $\text{AT}(\alpha_N, \beta) = \infty$. Indeed, consider the following sequence:

$$u_n(x) = \begin{cases} (\frac{1}{\omega_{N-1}})^{1/N} (\frac{n}{N-\beta})^{(N-1)/N} & \text{if } 0 \leq |x| \leq e^{-n/(N-\beta)}, \\ (\frac{N-\beta}{\omega_{N-1}n})^{1/N} \log(\frac{1}{|x|}) & \text{if } e^{-n/(N-\beta)} < |x| < 1, \\ 0 & \text{if } |x| \geq 1. \end{cases}$$

Then we can see easily that

$$\|\nabla u_n\|_N = 1; \quad \|u_n\|_N = o_n(1).$$

However,

$$\begin{aligned}
 \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha_N(1-\beta/N)|u_n|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx &\geq \int_{\{0 \leq |x| \leq e^{-n/(N-\beta)}\}} \frac{\phi_N(n)}{|x|^\beta} dx \\
 &= \omega_{N-1} \phi_N(n) \int_0^{e^{-n/(N-\beta)}} r^{N-1-\beta} dr = \frac{\omega_{N-1} \phi_N(n)}{e^n(N-\beta)} \rightarrow \frac{\omega_{N-1}}{N-\beta} \text{ as } n \rightarrow \infty.
 \end{aligned}$$

Now, it is clear that there exists a large constant M_1 , such that when $n \geq M_1$,

$$\begin{aligned}
 \|u_n\|_N^N &= \int_0^{e^{-n/(N-\beta)}} (\frac{1}{\omega_{N-1}})^{N/N} (\frac{n}{N-\beta})^{N(N-1)/N} r^{N-1} dr \\
 &\quad + \int_{e^{-n/(N-\beta)}}^1 (\frac{N-\beta}{\omega_{N-1}n})^{N/N} (\log(\frac{1}{r}))^N r^{N-1} dr \\
 &\approx n^{N-1} \int_0^{e^{-n/(N-\beta)}} r^{N-1} dr + \frac{1}{n} \int_0^{n/(N-\beta)} y^N e^{-Ny} dy \approx n^N e^{-\frac{nN}{N-\beta}} + \frac{1}{n} \approx \frac{1}{n}.
 \end{aligned}$$

So

$$\|u_n\|_N^{N-\beta} \approx \frac{1}{n^{(N-\beta)/N}} \quad \text{when } n \geq M_1.$$

Now we consider the following integral:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|u_n|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx &\geq \int_0^{e^{-n/(N-\beta)}} \phi_N(\alpha(1-\beta/N)(\frac{1}{\omega_{N-1}})^{1/(N-1)}(\frac{n}{N-\beta})) r^{N-1-\beta} dr \\
 &\geq \int_0^{e^{-n/(N-\beta)}} \phi_N(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}n) r^{N-1-\beta} dr \gtrsim \phi_N(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}n) e^{-n}.
 \end{aligned}$$

We note that there exists a large constant M_2 independent of α such that, for $n \geq M_2$,

$$\phi_N\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}n\right) \approx e^{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)n}$$

as long as $\alpha/\alpha_N \geq 1/2$.

Now we have

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \gtrsim e^{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)n} e^{-n} = e^{-\left(1 - \frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)n}.$$

Now, for α close enough to α_N , we can pick n such that $1 \leq (1 - \frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})n \leq 2$, i.e.,

$$\alpha \approx \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right) \alpha_N \geq \left(1 - \frac{1}{\max(M_1, M_2)}\right) \alpha_N$$

or

$$\max(M_1, M_2) \leq n \approx \frac{1}{1 - \alpha/\alpha_N},$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{\|u_n\|_N^{N-\beta}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\Phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u_n|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ (3.1) \qquad \qquad \qquad \gtrsim n^{(N-\beta)/N} e^{-2} \approx \left(\frac{1}{1 - \alpha/\alpha_N}\right)^{(N-\beta)/N}. \end{aligned}$$

And note that when α is close enough to α_N , we have

$$\frac{1 - (\alpha/\alpha_N)^{N-1}}{1 - \alpha/\alpha_N} \approx 1,$$

which implies

$$AT(\alpha, \beta) \geq \frac{c(N, \beta)}{\left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1}\right)^{(N-\beta)/N}}$$

when α is close enough to α_N . □

Now, we will provide a proof of the sharp critical Trudinger–Moser inequality, namely Theorem 1.2, using the above improved sharp subcritical Trudinger–Moser inequality (1.5). This suggests a new approach to and another look at the study of the sharp Trudinger–Moser inequality.

Proof of Theorem 1.2. First assume that $b \leq N$. Let $u \in W^{1,N}(\mathbb{R}^N) \setminus \{0\}$ such that $\|\nabla u\|_N^a + \|u\|_N^b \leq 1$. Assume that

$$\|\nabla u\|_N = \theta \in (0, 1); \quad \|u\|_N^b \leq 1 - \theta^a.$$

If $1/2 < \theta < 1$, then we set

$$v(x) = \frac{u(\lambda x)}{\theta}, \quad \text{with } \lambda = \frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{1/b}}{\theta} > 0.$$

Hence

$$\begin{aligned} \|\nabla v\|_N &= \frac{\|\nabla u\|_N}{\theta} = 1; \\ \|v\|_N^N &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |v|^N dx = \frac{1}{\theta^N} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |u(\lambda x)|^N dx = \frac{1}{\theta^N \lambda^N} \|u\|_N^N \leq \frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{N/b}}{\theta^N \lambda^N} = 1. \end{aligned}$$

By Theorem 1.1, we get

$$\begin{aligned} &\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha_N (1 - \frac{\beta}{N}) |u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx = \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha_N (1 - \frac{\beta}{N}) |u(\lambda x)|^{N/(N-1)})}{|\lambda x|^\beta} d(\lambda x) \\ &\leq \lambda^{N-\beta} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\theta^{N/(N-1)} \alpha_N (1 - \frac{\beta}{N}) |v|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq \lambda^{N-\beta} \text{AT}(\theta^{N/(N-1)} \alpha_N, \beta) \leq \left(\frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{N/b}}{\theta^N}\right)^{1-\beta/N} \frac{C(N, \beta)}{(1 - (\frac{\theta^{N/(N-1)} \alpha_N}{\alpha_N})^{N-1})^{1-\beta/N}} \\ &\leq \frac{((1 - \theta^a)^{N/b})^{1-\beta/N}}{(1 - \theta^N)^{1-\beta/N}} C(N, \beta) \leq C(N, \beta, a, b), \quad \text{since } b \leq N. \end{aligned}$$

If $0 < \theta \leq 1/2$, then with

$$v(x) = 2u(2x),$$

we have

$$\|\nabla v\|_N = 2\|\nabla u\|_N \leq 1 \quad \text{and} \quad \|v\|_N \leq 1.$$

By Theorem 1.1,

$$\begin{aligned} &\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha_N (1 - \beta/N) |u|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq 2^N \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\frac{\alpha_N (1-\beta/N)}{2^{N/(N-1)}} |v|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \leq C(N, \beta). \end{aligned}$$

Next, we will verify that the constant $\alpha_N (1 - \beta/N)$ is our best possible. Indeed, we choose the sequence $\{u_k\}$ as follows

$$(3.2) \quad u_n(x) = \begin{cases} (\frac{1}{\omega_{N-1}})^{1/N} (\frac{n}{N-\beta})^{(N-1)/N} & \text{if } 0 \leq |x| \leq e^{-n/(N-\beta)}, \\ (\frac{N-\beta}{\omega_{N-1} n})^{1/N} \log(\frac{1}{|x|}) & \text{if } e^{-n/(N-\beta)} < |x| < 1, \\ 0 & \text{if } |x| \geq 1. \end{cases}$$

Then,

$$\|\nabla u_n\|_N = 1; \quad \|u_n\|_N = O\left(\frac{1}{n^{1/N}}\right).$$

Set

$$w_n(x) = \lambda_n u_n(x),$$

where $\lambda_n \in (0, 1)$ is a solution of $\lambda_n^a + \lambda_n^b \|u_n\|_N^b = 1$, with

$$\lambda_n = 1 - O\left(\frac{1}{n^{\frac{b}{aN}}}\right) \rightarrow 1 \quad \text{as } k \rightarrow \infty.$$

Then

$$\|\nabla w_n\|_N^a + \|w_n\|_N^b = 1.$$

Also, for $\alpha > \alpha_N$,

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|w_n|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ & \geq \int_{\{0 \leq |x| \leq e^{-n/(N-1)}\}} \frac{\exp(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|w_n|^{N/(N-1)}) - \sum_{j=0}^{N-2} \frac{[\alpha(1 - \beta/N)]^j}{j!} |w_n|^{\frac{N}{N-1}j}}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ & \geq \left[\exp\left(\frac{\alpha n(1 - O(\frac{1}{n^{b/(a(N-1))}}))}{\alpha_N}\right) - O(k^{N-1}) \right] \frac{\omega_{N-1} \exp(-n)}{N - \beta} \rightarrow \infty \text{ as } n \rightarrow \infty. \end{aligned}$$

Now, we will show that

$$MT_{a,b}(\beta) = \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha_N)} \left(\frac{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}}{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{\frac{N-1}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}} AT(\alpha, \beta)$$

when $MT_{a,b}(\beta) < \infty$. Indeed, by (2.1), we have

$$\sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha_N)} \left(\frac{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}}{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{\frac{N-1}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}} AT(\alpha, \beta) \leq MT_{a,b}(\beta).$$

Now, let (u_n) be the maximizing sequence of $MT_{a,b}(\beta)$, i.e., $u_n \in W^{1,N}(\mathbb{R}^N) \setminus \{0\}$: $\|\nabla u_n\|_N^a + \|u_n\|_N^b \leq 1$ and

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha_N(1 - \beta/N)|u_n|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \rightarrow MT_{a,b}(\beta) \text{ as } n \rightarrow \infty.$$

We define

$$v_n(x) = \frac{u(\lambda_n x)}{\|\nabla u_n\|_N}, \quad \text{with } \lambda_n = \left(\frac{1 - \|\nabla u_n\|_N^a}{\|\nabla u_n\|_N^b} \right)^{1/b} > 0.$$

Hence

$$\|\nabla v_n\|_N = 1 \quad \text{and} \quad \|v_n\|_N \leq 1.$$

Also,

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_N(\alpha_N(1 - \beta/N)|u_n|^{N/(N-1)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ & = \lambda_n^{N-\beta} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N(\|\nabla u_n\|_N^{N/(N-1)} \alpha_N(1 - \beta/N)|v_n|^{N/(N-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ & \leq \lambda_n^{N-\beta} AT(\|\nabla u_n\|_N^{N/(N-1)} \alpha_N, \beta) \leq \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha_N)} \left(\frac{1 - (\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}}{(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N})^{\frac{N-1}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}} AT(\alpha, \beta). \end{aligned}$$

Hence, we receive

$$MT_{a,b}(\beta) = \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha_N)} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}} AT(\alpha, \beta)$$

when $MT_{a,b}(\beta) < \infty$.

Now, if there exists some $b > N$ such that $MT_{a,b}(\beta) < \infty$. Then we have

$$\overline{\lim}_{\alpha \rightarrow \alpha_N^-} \left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}} AT(\alpha, \beta) < \infty.$$

Also, since $MT(\beta) < \infty$,

$$\overline{\lim}_{\alpha \rightarrow \alpha_N^-} \left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{N}} AT(\alpha, \beta) < \infty.$$

By Theorem 1.1, we can show that

$$(3.3) \quad \overline{\lim}_{\alpha \rightarrow \alpha_N^-} \left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{N}} AT(\alpha, \beta) > 0.$$

Hence

$$\underline{\lim}_{\alpha \rightarrow \alpha_N^-} \frac{\left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{\frac{N-1}{N}a} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{b}}}{\left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha_N}\right)^{N-1} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{N}}} < \infty$$

which is impossible since $b > N$. The proof is now completed. □

4. Asymptotic behavior of subcritical Adams inequalities and relationship with the critical ones

4.1. Sharp Adams inequalities on $W^{2,N/2}(\mathbb{R}^N)$

In this subsection, we establish the asymptotic behavior of the suprema in the subcritical Adams inequalities, namely Theorem 1.3. Again, it is worthy noticing that no version of Theorem 1.4 is assumed in order to prove Theorem 1.3. Moreover, we also establish the relationship between the suprema for the critical and subcritical Adams inequalities (Theorem 1.4).

Proof of Theorem 1.3. By density arguments, we can assume $u \in C_0^\infty(\mathbb{R}^N) \setminus \{0\}$, $\|\Delta u\|_{N/2} \leq 1$ and $\|u\|_{N/2} = 1$. Now, noting that $|u| = \sqrt{u^2}$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial |u|}{\partial x_i} &= \frac{u \frac{\partial u}{\partial x_i}}{\sqrt{u^2}}; \\ \frac{\partial^2 |u|}{\partial x_i^2} &= \frac{\sqrt{u^2} \left(\frac{\partial u}{\partial x_i}\right)^2 + \sqrt{u^2} u \frac{\partial^2 u}{\partial x_i^2} - u \frac{\partial u}{\partial x_i} \frac{u \frac{\partial u}{\partial x_i}}{\sqrt{u^2}}}{u^2} = \frac{|u| u \frac{\partial^2 u}{\partial x_i^2}}{u^2}. \end{aligned}$$

Hence

$$\Delta |u| = \frac{|u| u \Delta u}{u^2}.$$

As a consequence,

$$|\Delta |u|| = |\Delta u|.$$

Now, we set

$$\Omega(u) = \left\{ x \in \mathbb{R}^N : |u(x)| > \left[1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)} \right)^{(N-2)/2} \right]^{2/N} \right\}.$$

Since $u \in C_0^\infty(\mathbb{R}^N)$, we have that $\Omega(u)$ is a bounded set. Moreover, we have

$$|\Omega(u)| \leq \int_{\Omega(u)} \frac{|u|^{N/2}}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)} \right)^{(N-2)/2}} dx \leq \frac{1}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)} \right)^{(N-2)/2}}.$$

Now, consider

$$I = \int_{\Omega(u)} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \leq \int_{\Omega(u)} \frac{\exp(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx.$$

On $\Omega(u)$, we set

$$v(x) = |u(x)| - \left[1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)} \right)^{(N-2)/2} \right]^{2/N}.$$

Then it is clear that $v \in W_N^{2,N/2}(\Omega(u))$ and $\|\Delta v\|_{N/2} \leq 1$. Also, on $\Omega(u)$, with $\varepsilon = \alpha(N, 2)/\alpha - 1$,

$$\begin{aligned} |u|^{N/(N-2)} &\leq (|v| + (1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)} \right)^{(N-2)/2})^{2/N})^{N/(N-2)} \\ &\leq (1 + \varepsilon)|v|^{N/(N-2)} + \left(1 - \frac{1}{(1+\varepsilon)^{(N-2)/2}} \right)^{2/(2-N)} \left| 1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)} \right)^{(N-2)/2} \right|^{N/(N-2)} \\ &= \frac{\alpha(N, 2)}{\alpha} |v|^{N/(N-2)} + 1. \end{aligned}$$

Hence, by the Adams inequality on bounded domains (Theorem D):

$$\begin{aligned} I &\leq \int_{\Omega(u)} \frac{\exp(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq \int_{\Omega(u)} \frac{\exp(\alpha(N, 2)(1 - \beta/N)|v|^{N/(N-2)} + \alpha)}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq C(N, \beta) |\Omega(u)|^{1-\beta/N} \leq C(N, \beta) \left(\frac{1}{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)} \right)^{(N-2)/2}} \right)^{1-\beta/N}. \end{aligned}$$

We also have the following estimate:

$$\begin{aligned} &\int_{\mathbb{R}^N \setminus \Omega(u)} \phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ &\leq \int_{\{u \leq 1\}} \phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \leq C(N) \int_{\{u \leq 1\}} \frac{|u|^{N/2}}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq C(N) \left(\int_{\{u \leq 1; |x| \geq 1\}} \frac{|u|^{N/2}}{|x|^\beta} dx + \int_{\{u \leq 1; |x| < 1\}} \frac{|u|^{N/2}}{|x|^\beta} dx \right) \leq C(N, \beta). \end{aligned}$$

In conclusion, we have

$$\text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta) \leq \frac{C(N, \beta)}{\left[1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N, 2)}\right)^{(N-2)/2}\right]^{1-\beta/N}}.$$

We now show that $\text{ATA}(\alpha(N, 2), \beta) = \infty$. Indeed, let $\psi \in C^\infty([0, 1])$ be such that

$$\psi(0) = \psi'(0) = 0; \quad \psi(1) = \psi'(1) = 1.$$

For $0 < \varepsilon < 1/2$ we set

$$H(t) = \begin{cases} \varepsilon \psi(t/\varepsilon) & \text{if } 0 < t \leq \varepsilon, \\ t & \text{if } \varepsilon < t \leq 1 - \varepsilon, \\ 1 - \varepsilon \psi((1-t)/\varepsilon) & \text{if } 1 - \varepsilon < t \leq 1, \\ 1 & \text{if } 1 < t, \end{cases}$$

and consider Adams' test functions

$$\psi_r(|x|) = H\left(\frac{\log \frac{1}{|x|}}{\log \frac{1}{r}}\right).$$

By construction, $\psi_r \in W^{2, N/2}(\mathbb{R}^N)$ and $\psi_r(|x|) = 1$ for $x \in B_r$. Moreover, by [2],

$$\begin{aligned} \|\Delta \psi_r\|_{N/2}^{N/2} &\leq \omega_{N-1} a(N, 2)^{N/2} \log\left(\frac{1}{r}\right)^{1-N/2} A_r; \\ \|\psi_r\|_{N/2}^{N/2} &= o\left(\left(\frac{1}{\log\left(\frac{1}{r}\right)}\right)^{(N-2)/2}\right); \quad a(N, 2) = \frac{\alpha(N, 2)^{(N-2)/N}}{N\sigma_N^{2/N}}; \\ A_r &= A_r(N, 2) = \left[1 + 2\varepsilon(\|\psi'\|_\infty + O\left(\frac{1}{\log\left(\frac{1}{r}\right)}\right))\right]^{N/2}; \end{aligned}$$

Now, we set

$$u_r(|x|) = \left(\log\left(\frac{1}{r}\right)\right)^{(N-2)/N} \psi_r(|x|).$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} u_r(|x|) &= \left(\log\left(\frac{1}{r}\right)\right)^{(N-2)/N} \quad \text{for } x \in B_r \\ \|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}^{N/2} &\leq \omega_{N-1} a(N, 2)^{N/2} A_r, \quad \text{and} \\ \|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}^{N/(N-2)} &\leq \frac{\alpha(N, 2)}{N} A_r^{2/(N-2)}. \end{aligned}$$

Now,

$$\begin{aligned} &\text{ATA}(\alpha(N, 2), \beta) \\ &\geq \lim_{r \rightarrow 0^+} \frac{1}{\left\|\frac{u_r}{\|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}}\right\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}} \int_{B_r} \phi_{N,2}\left(\alpha(N, 2)(1-\beta/N) \left|\frac{u_r}{\|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}}\right|^{N/(N-2)}\right) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ &\geq \lim_{r \rightarrow 0^+} \frac{\|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}}{\|u_r\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}} \int_{B_r} \phi_{N,2}\left(\frac{\alpha(N, 2)(1-\frac{\beta}{N}) \log\left(\frac{1}{r}\right)}{\|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}^{N/(N-2)}}\right) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ &\geq \lim_{r \rightarrow 0^+} \frac{\|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}}{\|u_r\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}} \phi_{N,2}\left(\frac{(N-\beta) \log\left(\frac{1}{r}\right)}{\left[1+2\varepsilon(\|\psi'\|_\infty + O\left(\frac{1}{\log\left(\frac{1}{r}\right)}\right))\right]^{N/2} 2^{(N-2)}}\right) \omega_{N-1} \frac{r^{N-\beta}}{N-\beta} \\ &\rightarrow \infty \text{ as } r \rightarrow 0^+. \end{aligned}$$

Now, we consider the following sequence

$$u_k(x) = \begin{cases} \left[\frac{1}{\alpha(N,2)} \ln k \right]^{1-2/N} - \frac{N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}}{2} \frac{|x|^2}{(\ln k)^{2/N}} \\ \quad + \frac{N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}}{2} \frac{1}{(\ln k)^{2/N}} & \text{if } 0 \leq |x| \leq (1/k)^{1/N}, \\ N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N} \ln \frac{1}{|x|} & \text{if } (1/k)^{1/N} \leq |x| \leq 1, \\ \zeta_k & \text{if } |x| > 1, \end{cases}$$

where ζ_k is a smooth function satisfying $\text{supp}(\zeta_k) \subset \{|x| < 2\}$ and

$$\zeta_k|_{|x|=1} = 0; \quad \frac{\partial \zeta_k}{\partial \nu} \Big|_{|x|=1} = N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N},$$

and ζ_k and $\Delta \zeta_k$ are all $O((\frac{1}{\ln k})^{2/N})$. For instance, we can choose

$$\zeta_k(x) = \frac{1}{2}N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N} - \frac{1}{2}N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N}|x|^2 \text{ near } |x| = 1.$$

The choice of the above sequence is inspired by a similar sequence in [32] in dimension four case. Then,

$$\frac{\partial u_k}{\partial x_i}(x) = \begin{cases} -\frac{N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}}{2} \frac{2x_i}{(\ln k/k)^{2/N}} & \text{if } 0 < |x| < (1/k)^{1/N}, \\ -N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N} x_i/|x|^2 & \text{if } (1/k)^{1/N} < |x| < 1, \\ \partial \zeta_k / \partial x_i & \text{if } |x| > 1, \end{cases}$$

and

$$\frac{\partial^2 u_k}{\partial x_i^2}(x) = \begin{cases} -\frac{N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}}{2} \frac{2}{(\ln k/k)^{2/N}} & \text{if } 0 < |x| < (1/k)^{1/N}, \\ -N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N} (|x|^2 - 2x_i^2)/|x|^4 & \text{if } (1/k)^{1/N} < |x| < 1, \\ \partial^2 \zeta_k / \partial x_i^2 & \text{if } |x| > 1. \end{cases}$$

Hence

$$\Delta u_k(x) = \begin{cases} -\frac{N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}}{2} \frac{2N}{(\ln k/k)^{2/N}} & \text{if } 0 < |x| < (1/k)^{1/N}, \\ -N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N} (N-2)/|x|^2 & \text{if } (1/k)^{1/N} < |x| < 1, \\ \Delta \zeta_k & \text{if } |x| > 1. \end{cases}$$

Thus

$$\begin{aligned} & \|\Delta u_k\|_{N/2}^{N/2} \\ &= \int_{1 < |x| < 2} |\Delta \zeta_k|^{N/2} dx + \omega_{N-1} \int_0^{(1/k)^{1/N}} \left[\frac{N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}}{2} \frac{2N}{(\ln k/k)^{2/N}} \right]^{N/2} r^{N-1} dr \\ & \quad + \omega_{N-1} \int_{(1/k)^{1/N}}^1 \left[N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N} \frac{(N-2)}{r^2} \right]^{N/2} r^{N-1} dr \\ &= \int_{1 < |x| < 2} |\Delta \zeta_k|^{N/2} dx + \omega_{N-1} \left[\frac{N\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}}{2} \frac{2N}{(\ln k/k)^{2/N}} \right]^{N/2} \frac{1}{N} \frac{1}{k} \\ & \quad + \omega_{N-1} [N(N-2)\alpha(N,2)^{2/N-1}(\ln k)^{-2/N}]^{N/2} \frac{1}{N} \ln k. \end{aligned}$$

Hence we can conclude that

$$1 \leq \|\Delta u_k\|_{N/2}^{N/2} \leq 1 + O\left(\frac{1}{\ln k}\right).$$

Also,

$$\begin{aligned} \|u_k\|_{N/2}^{N/2} &\leq \omega_{N-1} (N\alpha(N, 2)^{2/N-1} (\ln k)^{-2/N})^{N/2} \int_0^1 r^{N-1} \left(\ln \frac{1}{r}\right)^{N/2} dr \\ &\quad + \frac{\omega_{N-1}}{N} \left(\left[\frac{1}{\alpha(N, 2)} \ln k\right]^{1-2/N} + \frac{N\alpha(N, 2)^{2/N-1}}{2} \frac{1}{(\ln k)^{2/N}} \right)^{N/2} \frac{1}{k} \\ &\quad + \int_{1 < |x| < 2} |\zeta_k|^{N/2} dx \\ &\leq A (\ln k)^{-1} + B (\ln k)^{(N-2)/2} \frac{1}{k} \end{aligned}$$

for some constants $A, B > 0$.

Let

$$v_k = \frac{u_k}{\|\Delta u_k\|_{N/2}}.$$

Then

$$\|\Delta v_k\|_{N/2} = 1 \quad \text{and} \quad \|v_k\|_{N/2}^{N/2} \leq \|u_k\|_{N/2}^{N/2} \leq A (\ln k)^{-1} + B (\ln k)^{(N-2)/2} \frac{1}{k}.$$

By the definition of $\text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta)$, we get

$$\begin{aligned} \text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta) &\geq \frac{1}{\|v_k\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|v_k|^{N/(N-2)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ &\geq \frac{1}{\|v_k\|_{N/2}^{\frac{N}{2}(1-\beta/N)}} \int_{|x| \leq (1/k)^{1/N}} \phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|v_k|^{N/(N-2)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ &\geq C \frac{\exp\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N, 2)}(1-\beta/N)\left(\frac{1}{\|\Delta u_k\|_{N/2}^{N/(N-2)}} - \frac{\alpha(N, 2)}{\alpha}\right) \ln k\right)}{(A(\ln k)^{-1} + B(\ln k)^{(N-2)/2} \frac{1}{k})^{1-\beta/N}} \end{aligned}$$

Note that when k (independent of α) is large

$$\frac{1}{\|\Delta u_k\|_{N/2}^{N/(N-2)}} - \frac{\alpha(N, 2)}{\alpha} \approx 1 - \frac{\alpha(N, 2)}{\alpha}.$$

So we have

$$\text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta) \gtrsim \exp\left\{\left(1 - \frac{\beta}{N}\right)\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N, 2)} - 1\right) \ln k\right\} \cdot (\ln k)^{1-\beta/N}.$$

When α is close enough to $\alpha(N, 2)$, we are able to choose k large enough as required before such that

$$\ln k \approx \frac{1}{1 - \alpha/\alpha(N, 2)}$$

or

$$(1 - \beta/N) (\alpha/\alpha(N, 2) - 1) \ln k \approx 1.$$

Then

$$\text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta) \gtrsim C \cdot \left(\frac{1}{1 - \alpha/\alpha(N, 2)} \right)^{1-\beta/N} \approx \left(\frac{1}{1 - (\alpha/\alpha(N, 2))^{(N-2)/2}} \right)^{1-\beta/N}$$

when α is close enough to $\alpha(N, 2)$. □

We now offer another proof to Theorem 1.4 using the improved sharp subcritical Adams inequality (1.7).

Proof of Theorem 1.4. Assume $0 < b \leq N/2$. Let $u \in W^{2, N/2}(\mathbb{R}^N) \setminus \{0\}$ with $\|\Delta u\|_{N/2}^a + \|u\|_{N/2}^b \leq 1$. Assume that

$$\|\Delta u\|_{N/2} = \theta \in (0, 1); \quad \|u\|_{N/2}^b \leq 1 - \theta^a.$$

If $1/4 < \theta < 1$, then we set

$$v(x) = \frac{u(\lambda x)}{\theta}, \quad \text{with} \quad \lambda = \frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{1/(2b)}}{\theta^{1/2}} > 0.$$

Hence

$$\begin{aligned} \|\Delta v\|_{N/2} &= \frac{\|\Delta u\|_{N/2}}{\theta} = 1; \\ \|v\|_{N/2}^{N/2} &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |v|^{N/2} dx = \frac{1}{\theta^{N/2}} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |u(\lambda x)|^{N/2} dx = \frac{1}{\theta^{N/2} \lambda^N} \|u\|_{N/2}^{N/2} \\ &\leq \frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{\frac{N}{2b}}}{\theta^{N/2} \lambda^N} = 1. \end{aligned}$$

By Theorem 1.3, we get

$$\begin{aligned} &\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(N, 2)(1 - \beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(N, 2)(1 - \beta/N)|u(\lambda x)|^{N/(N-2)})}{|\lambda x|^\beta} d(\lambda x) \\ &\leq \lambda^{N-\beta} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\theta^{N/(N-2)}\alpha(N, 2)(1 - \beta/N)|v|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq \lambda^{N-\beta} \text{ATA}(\theta^{N/(N-2)}\alpha(N, 2), \beta) \\ &\leq \left(\frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{1/(2b)}}{\theta^{1/2}} \right)^{N-\beta} \frac{C(N, \beta)}{\left[1 - \left(\frac{\theta^{N/(N-2)}\alpha(N, 2)}{\alpha(N, 2)} \right)^{(N-2)/2} \right]^{1-\beta/N}} \\ &\leq \frac{((1 - \theta^a)^{N/(2b)})^{1-\beta/N}}{(1 - \theta^{N/2})^{1-\beta/N}} C(N, \beta) \leq C(N, \beta, a, b) \quad \text{since } b \leq \frac{N}{2}. \end{aligned}$$

If $0 < \theta \leq 1/4$, then with

$$v(x) = 2^2 u(2x),$$

we have

$$\|\Delta v\|_{N/2} = 4 \|\Delta u\|_{N/2} \leq 1 \quad \text{and} \quad \|v\|_{N/2} \leq 1.$$

By Theorem 1.3,

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(N,2)(1-\beta/N)|u|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ & \leq 4^N \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_N\left(\frac{\alpha(N,2)(1-\beta/N)}{4^{N/(N-2)}}|v|^{N/(N-2)}\right)}{|x|^\beta} dx \leq C(N,\beta). \end{aligned}$$

We now also consider the Adams test functions as in the proof of Theorem 1.3. Let $\alpha > \alpha(N,2)$. Set

$$w_r(|x|) = \lambda_r \frac{u_r(|x|)}{\|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}}$$

where $\lambda_r \in (0,1)$ is a solution of

$$\lambda_r^a + \frac{\lambda_r^b \|u_r\|_{N/2}^b}{\|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}^b} = 1, \quad \lambda_r \rightarrow 1 \quad \text{as } r \rightarrow 0^+.$$

Then

$$\|\Delta w_r\|_{N/2}^a + \|w_r\|_{N/2}^b = 1$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} & \lim_{r \rightarrow 0^+} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\alpha(1-\beta/N)|w_r|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ & \geq \lim_{r \rightarrow 0^+} \int_{B_r} \phi_{N,2}\left(\frac{\alpha(1-\beta/N)\lambda_r^{N/(N-2)}|u_r|^{N/(N-2)}}{\|\Delta u_r\|_{N/2}^{N/(N-2)}}\right) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ & \geq \lim_{r \rightarrow 0^+} \omega_{N-1} \frac{r^{N-\beta}}{N-\beta} \phi_{N,2}\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)} \frac{(N-\beta)\log(\frac{1}{r})}{[1+2\varepsilon(\|\psi'\|_\infty + O(\frac{1}{\log(\frac{1}{r}})))]^{N/2}}\right)^{2/(N-2)} \\ & \rightarrow \infty \quad \text{as } r \rightarrow 0^+ \text{ if we choose } \varepsilon \text{ small enough.} \end{aligned}$$

It now remains to show that

$$A_{a,b}(\beta) = \sup_{\alpha \in (0,\alpha(N,2))} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}} \text{ATA}(\alpha,\beta).$$

By (2.2),

$$\sup_{\alpha \in (0,\alpha(N,2))} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}} \text{ATA}(\alpha,\beta) \leq A_{a,b}(\beta).$$

Now, let (u_n) be the maximizing sequence of $A_{a,b}(\beta)$, i.e., $u_n \in W^{2,N/2}(\mathbb{R}^N) \setminus \{0\}$ with $\|\Delta u_n\|_{N/2}^a + \|u_n\|_{N/2}^b \leq 1$ and

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_{N,2}(\alpha(N,2)(1 - \beta/N)|u_n|^{N/(N-2)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \rightarrow A_{a,b}(\beta) \quad \text{as } n \rightarrow \infty.$$

We define a new sequence:

$$v_n(x) = \frac{u(\lambda_n x)}{\|\Delta u_n\|_{N/2}}, \quad \text{with } \lambda_n = \left(\frac{1 - \|\Delta u_n\|_{N/2}^a}{\|\Delta u_n\|_{N/2}^b} \right)^{1/(2b)} > 0.$$

Hence

$$\|\Delta v_n\|_{N/2} = 1 \quad \text{and} \quad \|v_n\|_{N/2} \leq 1.$$

Also,

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \phi_{N,2}(\alpha(N,2)(1 - \beta/N)|u_n|^{N/(N-2)}) \frac{dx}{|x|^\beta} \\ &= \lambda_n^{N-\beta} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,2}(\|\Delta u_n\|_{N/2}^{N/(N-2)} \alpha(N,2)(1 - \beta/N)|v_n|^{N/(N-2)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq \lambda_n^{N-\beta} \text{ATA}(\|\Delta u_n\|_{N/2}^{N/(N-2)} \alpha(N,2), \beta) \\ &\leq \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha(N,2))} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}} \text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta). \end{aligned}$$

Now, we assume that there is some $b > N/2$ such that $A_{a,b}(\beta) < \infty$. Then

$$A_{a,b}(\beta) = \sup_{\alpha \in (0, \alpha(N,2))} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}} \text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta),$$

and so

$$\overline{\lim}_{\alpha \uparrow \alpha(N,2)} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}} \text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta) < \infty.$$

Also, by Theorem 1.3,

$$(4.1) \quad \overline{\lim}_{\alpha \uparrow \alpha(N,2)} \left(\frac{1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}}{\left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}b}} \right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{N}} \text{ATA}(\alpha, \beta) > 0,$$

Hence,

$$\underline{\lim}_{\alpha \uparrow \alpha(N,2)} \frac{\left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}\right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{2b}}}{\left(1 - \left(\frac{\alpha}{\alpha(N,2)}\right)^{\frac{N-2}{N}a}\right)^{\frac{N-\beta}{N}}} > 0,$$

which is impossible since $b > N/2$. The proof is now complete. □

4.2. Adams inequalities on $W^{\gamma, N/\gamma}(\mathbb{R}^N)$. Proof of Theorem 1.5

Let $u \in W^{\gamma, p}(\mathbb{R}^N) \setminus \{0\}$ with $\|(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2}u\|_p^a + \|u\|_p^b \leq 1$. We set

$$\|(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2}u\|_p = \theta \in (0, 1); \quad \|u\|_p^b \leq 1 - \theta^a.$$

If $1/2^\gamma < \theta < 1$, then by defining a new function

$$v(x) = \frac{u(\lambda x)}{\theta}, \quad \text{with } \lambda = \frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{1/(\gamma b)}}{\theta^{1/\gamma}} > 0.$$

we get

$$(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2}v(x) = \frac{\lambda^\gamma}{\theta}((-\Delta)^{\gamma/2}u)(\lambda x).$$

Hence,

$$\begin{aligned} \|(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2}v\|_p &= \frac{\|(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2}u\|_p}{\theta} = 1; \\ \|v\|_p^p &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |v|^p dx = \frac{1}{\theta^p} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} |u(\lambda x)|^p dx = \frac{1}{\theta^p \lambda^N} \|u\|_p^p \leq \frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{p/b}}{\theta^p \lambda^N} = 1. \end{aligned}$$

By the definition of $\text{GATA}(\alpha, \beta)$, we get

$$\begin{aligned} &\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,\gamma}(\beta_0(N, \gamma)(1 - \beta/N) |u|^{p/(p-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &= \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,\gamma}(\beta_0(N, \gamma)(1 - \beta/N) |u(\lambda x)|^{p/(p-1)})}{|\lambda x|^\beta} d(\lambda x) \\ &\leq \lambda^{N-\beta} \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,\gamma}(\theta^{p/(p-1)}\beta_0(N, \gamma)(1 - \beta/N) |v|^{p/(p-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq \lambda^{N-\beta} \text{GATA}(\theta^{p/(p-1)}\beta_0(N, \gamma), \beta) \\ &\leq \left(\frac{(1 - \theta^a)^{1/(\gamma b)}}{\theta^{1/\gamma}}\right)^{N-\beta} \frac{C(N, \beta)}{\left[1 - \left(\frac{\theta^{p/(p-1)}\beta_0(N, \gamma)}{\beta_0(N, \gamma)}\right)^{(p-1)/p}\right]^{1-\beta/N}} \\ &\leq \frac{((1 - \theta^a)^{\frac{N}{\gamma b}})^{1-\beta/N}}{(1 - \theta)^{1-\beta/N}} C(N, \beta) \leq C(N, \beta, a, b), \quad \text{since } b \leq p. \end{aligned}$$

If $0 < \theta \leq 1/2^\gamma$, then with

$$v(x) = 2^\gamma u(2x),$$

we have

$$\|(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2}v\|_p = 2^\gamma \|(-\Delta)^{\gamma/2}u\|_p \leq 1 \quad \text{and} \quad \|v\|_p \leq 1.$$

By the definition of $\text{GATA}(\alpha, \beta)$,

$$\begin{aligned} &\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,\gamma}(\beta_0(N, \gamma)(1 - \beta/N) |u|^{p/(p-1)})}{|x|^\beta} dx \\ &\leq 2^N \int_{\mathbb{R}^N} \frac{\phi_{N,\gamma}\left(\frac{\beta_0(N, \gamma)}{2^{Np/(p-1)}}(1 - \beta/N) |v|^{p/(p-1)}\right)}{|x|^\beta} dx \leq C(N, \beta). \end{aligned}$$

Acknowledgement. The results of this paper have been presented in invited talks by the second author at Zhejiang University in China in June, 2014 and at the Workshop on Partial Differential Equation and its Applications at IMS in Singapore in December 2014 and by the first author at the AMS special session on Geometric inequalities and Nonlinear Partial Differential Equations in Las Vegas in April 2015. The authors wish to thank the organizers for invitations. The authors also wish to thank the referee for his very careful reading and many excellent suggestions and comments which improve not only the exposition of the paper but also help us to improve the construction of the sequence in the proof of lower bound of the asymptotic behavior of the supremum of the Adams inequality in Theorem 1.3.

References

- [1] ADACHI, S. AND TANAKA, K.: Trudinger type inequalities in \mathbb{R}^N and their best exponents. *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **128** (2000), no. 7, 2051–2057.
- [2] ADAMS, D. R.: A sharp inequality of J. Moser for higher order derivatives. *Ann. of Math. (2)* **128** (1988), no. 2, 385–398.
- [3] BECKNER, W.: Sharp Sobolev inequalities on the sphere and the Moser–Trudinger inequality. *Ann. of Math. (2)* **138** (1993), no. 1, 213–242.
- [4] BRANSON, T., CHANG, S.-Y. A. AND YANG, P.: Estimates and extremals for zeta function determinants on four-manifolds. *Comm. Math. Phys.* **149** (1992), 241–262.
- [5] CARLESON, L. AND CHANG, S.-Y. A.: On the existence of an extremal function for an inequality of J. Moser. *Bull. Sci. Math. (2)* **110** (1986), no. 2, 113–127.
- [6] CASSANI, D., SANI, F. AND TARSI, C: Equivalent Moser type inequalities in R^2 and the zero mass case. *J. Funct. Anal.* **267** (2014), no. 11, 4236–4263.
- [7] CHANG, S.-Y. A., GURSKY, M. AND YANG, P.: An equation of Monge–Ampère type in conformal geometry, and four manifolds of positive Ricci curvature. *Ann. of Math. (2)* **155** (2002), no. 3, 709–787.
- [8] CHANG, S.-Y. A. AND QING, J.: The zeta functional determinants on manifolds with boundary. I. The formula. *J. Funct. Anal.* **147** (1997), no. 2, 327–362.
- [9] CHANG, S.-Y. A. AND QING, J.: The zeta functional determinants on manifolds with boundary. II. Extremal metrics and compactness of isospectral set. *J. Funct. Anal.* **147** (1997), no. 2, 363–399.
- [10] CHANG, S.-Y. A. AND YANG, P.: Extremal metrics of zeta function determinants on 4-manifolds. *Ann. of Math. (2)* **142** (1995), no. 1, 171–212.
- [11] CHANG, S.-Y. A. AND YANG, P.: Non-linear partial differential equations in conformal geometry. In *Proceedings of the International Congress of Mathematicians, Vol. I (Beijing, 2002)*, 189–207. Higher Ed. Press, Beijing, 2002.
- [12] CHANG, S.-Y. A. AND YANG, P.: The inequality of Moser and Trudinger and applications to conformal geometry. Dedicated to the memory of Jürgen K. Moser. *Comm. Pure Appl. Math.* **56** (2003), no. 8, 1135–1150.
- [13] COHN, W. AND LU, G.: Best constants for Moser–Trudinger inequalities on the Heisenberg group. *Indiana Univ. Math. J.* **50** (2001), no. 4, 1567–1591.

- [14] DJADLI, Z. AND MALCHIODI, A.: Existence of conformal metrics with constant Q -curvature. *Ann. of Math. (2)* **168** (2008), no. 3, 813–858.
- [15] FLUCHER, M.: Extremal functions for the Trudinger–Moser inequality in 2 dimensions. *Comment. Math. Helv.* **67** (1992), no. 3, 471–497.
- [16] FONTANA, L.: Sharp borderline Sobolev inequalities on compact Riemannian manifolds. *Comment. Math. Helv.* **68** (1993), 415–454.
- [17] JUDOVIČ, V. I.: Some estimates connected with integral operators and with solutions of elliptic equations. *Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR* **138** (1961), 805–808.
- [18] LAM, N. AND LU, G.: The Moser–Trudinger and Adams inequalities and elliptic and subelliptic equations with nonlinearity of exponential growth. In *Recent developments in geometry and analysis*, 179–251. Adv. Lect. Math. (ALM) 23, Int. Press, Somerville, MA, 2012.
- [19] LAM, N. AND LU, G.: Sharp Adams type inequalities in Sobolev spaces $W^{m,n/m}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ for arbitrary integer m . *J. Differential Equations* **253** (2012), no. 4, 1143–1171.
- [20] LAM, N. AND LU, G.: Sharp singular Adams inequalities in high order Sobolev spaces. *Methods Appl. Anal.* **19** (2012), no. 3, 243–266.
- [21] LAM, N. AND LU, G.: Sharp Trudinger–Moser inequality on the Heisenberg group at the critical case and applications. *Adv. Math.* **231** (2012), no. 6, 3259–3287.
- [22] LAM, N. AND LU, G.: A new approach to sharp Moser–Trudinger and Adams type inequalities: a rearrangement-free argument. *J. Differential Equations* **255** (2013), no. 3, 298–325.
- [23] LAM, N., LU, G. AND TANG, H.: Sharp subcritical Moser–Trudinger inequalities on Heisenberg groups and subelliptic PDEs. *Nonlinear Anal.* **95** (2014), 77–92.
- [24] LAM, N., LU, G. AND ZHANG, L.: Existence and nonexistence of extremal functions for sharp Trudinger–Moser inequalities. Preprint.
- [25] LI, Y. X.: Extremal functions for the Moser–Trudinger inequalities on compact Riemannian manifolds. *Sci. China Ser. A* **48** (2005), no. 5, 618–648.
- [26] LI, J. AND LU, G.: Critical and subcritical Moser–Trudinger inequalities on complete noncompact Riemannian manifolds. Preprint.
- [27] LI, Y. X. AND NDIAYE, C.: Extremal functions for Moser–Trudinger type inequality on compact closed 4-manifolds. *J. Geom. Anal.* **17** (2007), no. 4, 669–699.
- [28] LI, Y. X. AND RUF, B.: A sharp Trudinger–Moser type inequality for unbounded domains in \mathbb{R}^n . *Indiana Univ. Math. J.* **57** (2008), no. 1, 451–480.
- [29] LIN, K.: Extremal functions for Moser’s inequality. *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* **348** (1996), no. 7, 2663–2671.
- [30] LU, G. AND TANG, H.: Best constants for Moser–Trudinger inequalities on high dimensional hyperbolic spaces. *Adv. Nonlinear Stud.* **13** (2013), no. 4, 1035–1052.
- [31] LU, G. AND TANG, H.: Sharp singular Trudinger–Moser inequalities in Lorentz–Sobolev spaces. *Adv. Nonlinear Stud.* **16** (2016), no. 3, 581–601.
- [32] LU, G. AND YANG, Y.: Adams’ inequalities for bi-Laplacian and extremal functions in dimension four. *Adv. Math.* **220** (2009), 1135–1170.
- [33] MOSER, J.: A sharp form of an inequality by N. Trudinger. *Indiana Univ. Math. J.* **20** (1970/71), 1077–1092.
- [34] PANEITZ, S.: A quartic conformally covariant differential operator for arbitrary pseudo-Riemannian manifolds. *SIGMA Symmetry Integrability Geom. Methods Appl.* **4** (2008), Paper 036, 3 pp.

- [35] POHOŽAEV, S. I.: On the eigenfunctions of the equation $\Delta u + \lambda f(u) = 0$. *Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR* **165** (1965), 36–39.
- [36] RUF, B.: A sharp Trudinger–Moser type inequality for unbounded domains in \mathbb{R}^2 . *J. Funct. Anal.* **219** (2005), no. 2, 340–367.
- [37] RUF, B. AND SANI, F.: Sharp Adams-type inequalities in \mathbb{R}^n . *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* **365** (2013), no. 2, 645–670.
- [38] STEIN, E. M.: *Singular integrals and differentiability properties of functions*. Princeton Mathematical Series 30, Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ, 1970.
- [39] TARSI, C.: Adams’ inequality and limiting Sobolev embeddings into Zygmund spaces. *Potential Anal.* **37** (2012), no. 4, 353–385.
- [40] TIAN, G.: Kähler–Einstein metrics with positive scalar curvature. *Invent. Math.* **130** (1997), no. 1, 1–37.
- [41] TIAN, G. AND ZHU, X.: A nonlinear inequality of Moser–Trudinger type. *Calc. Var. Partial Differential Equations* **10** (2000), no. 4, 349–354.
- [42] TRUDINGER, N. S.: On imbeddings into Orlicz spaces and some applications. *J. Math. Mech.* **17** (1967), 473–483.
- [43] WEI, J. AND XU, X.: Prescribing Q -curvature problem on S^n . *J. Funct. Anal.* **257** (2009), no. 7, 1995–2023.

Received July 31, 2015; revised February 19, 2016.

NGUYEN LAM: Department of Mathematics, The University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada V6T 1Z2; and Department of Mathematics, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA 15260, USA.

E-mail: nlam@math.ubc.ca

GUOZHEN LU: Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, Storrs, CT 06269, USA.

E-mail: guozhen.lu@uconn.edu

LU ZHANG (corresponding author): Department of Mathematical Sciences, Binghamton University, Binghamton, NY 13902, USA.

E-mail: luzhang@binghamton.edu