Elemente der Mathematik (Online first)
DOI 10.4171/EM/482



# *Short note* The equation $x/y + y/z + z/x = 4$ revisited

Nguyen Xuan Tho

**Abstract.** We give an elementary argument to the fact that the equation $x/y + y/z + z/x = 4$ has no positive integer solutions.

Quoting from Spierpiński's classical book *250 Problems in Elementary Number Theory* [3, page 80], "we do not know whether the equation

$$\frac{x}{y} + \frac{y}{z} + \frac{z}{x} = 4 \tag{1}$$

has positive integer solutions $x, y, z$". Erik Dofs [2] showed that the equation $a^3 + b^3 + c^3 = nabc$ has no *integer* solutions for $n = 4$ and many other values of $n$. By letting $x = a^2b$, $y = b^2c$, $z = c^2a$, equation (1) transforms into $a^3 + b^3 + c^3 = 4abc$. Hence equation (1) has no integer (positive integer) solutions. For the general equation $x/y + y/z + z/x = n$, elliptic curves are the natural setting; see [1]. So an elementary argument for Spierpiński's remark is desirable. In this note, we provide such an argument.

**Theorem 1.** *There do not exist positive integers $x, y, z$ satisfying*

$$\frac{x}{y} + \frac{y}{z} + \frac{z}{x} = 4. \tag{2}$$

We need the following lemma.

**Lemma 1.** *Let $n$ be an odd positive integer such that every prime divisor $p$ of $n$ is equivalent to* $1 \pmod 4$. *Then there exist integers $A, B$ such that $n = A^2 + B^2$.*

*Proof.* This is the special case of the Sum of Two Squares Theorem. For a proof, see Silverman [4, Theorem 25.1, page 196]. ∎

For an odd prime number $p$, $(\cdot\,|\,p)$ denotes the Legendre symbol. Note that $(-1|p) = 1$ if and only if $p \equiv 1 \pmod 4$. We are now ready to prove Theorem 1. Assume that there exist positive integers $x, y, z$ satisfying (2). If $xy - z^2 = 0$, $yz - x^2 = 0$, and $zx - y^2 = 0$, then $xyz = x^3 = y^3 = z^3$ so that $x = y = z$. Hence (2) is impossible. So at least one of $xy - z^2$, $yz - x^2$, $zx - y^2$ is nonzero. We can assume that $xz - y^2 \neq 0$. From (2), we have $x/y + y/z = 4 - z/x$. Hence $4x - z > 0$ and

$$\left(\frac{x}{y} - \frac{y}{z}\right)^2 = \left(4 - \frac{z}{x}\right)^2 - 4\frac{x}{z}.$$

Thus

$$\Big(\frac{x(xz-y^2)}{y}\Big)^2 = z\big(-4x^3 + z(z-4x)^2\big). \tag{3}$$

Let $a = -x$ and $b = z$. Then $a < 0$, $b > 0$, and $4a + b = z - 4x < 0$. From (3), we have $b(4a^3 + b(4a+b)^2)$ is a rational square, hence an integral square. Let $d = \gcd(b, 4a^3 + b(4a+b)^2)$. Then $d \mid 4$. Therefore, $d \in \{1, 2, 4\}$.

*Case 1:* $d = 1$. Then $b = s^2$ and $4a^3 + b(4a+b)^2 = t^2$, where $s, t \in \mathbb{Z}^+$, $2 \nmid t$, $2 \nmid s$, and $\gcd(s,t) = 1$. Assume that $p$ is a prime divisor of $4a + b$. Then $p$ is odd. We have $t^2 \equiv 4a^3 \pmod{p}$. Therefore,

$$0 \equiv a^2(4a+b) \equiv t^2 + (as)^2 \pmod{p}. \tag{4}$$

Since $\gcd(a,b) = 1$ and $p \mid 4a + b$, we have $p \nmid a$ and $p \nmid b$. Hence $p \nmid t$ and $p \nmid as$. Thus, from (4), we have $(-1|p) = 1$. Hence $p \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$. This holds for every prime divisor of $4a + b$. Since $4a + b < 0$, by Lemma 1, we have $-(4a+b) = A^2 + B^2$, where $A, B \in \mathbb{Z}$. Therefore, $-(4a + s^2) = A^2 + B^2$. Since $2 \nmid s$, we have

$$-1 \equiv -(4a + s^2) \equiv A^2 + B^2 \pmod{4},$$

which is impossible since $A^2 + B^2 \equiv 0, 1, 2 \pmod{4}$.

*Case 2:* $d = 2$. Then $b = 2s^2$ and $4a^3 + b(4a+b)^2 = 2t^2$, where $s, t \in \mathbb{Z}^+$, and $\gcd(s,t) = 1$. Since $2 \mid b$, we have $2 \nmid a$. Since $t^2 = 2a^3 + 4s^2(2a+s^2)^2$, we have $2 \mid t$. So $4 \mid t^2$. Thus $4 \mid 2a^3$, which is impossible since $2 \nmid a$.

*Case 3:* $d = 4$. Then $b = 4s^2$ and $4a^3 + b(4a+b)^2 = 4t^2$, where $s, t \in \mathbb{Z}^+$, $\gcd(s,t) = 1$. We have

$$a^3 + 16s^2(a+s^2)^2 = t^2. \tag{5}$$

Since $2 \mid b$, we have $2 \nmid a$. From (5), we have $2 \nmid t$. Reducing (5) mod 8 gives $a \equiv 1 \pmod{8}$. Since $a + s^2 = (4a+b)/4$, we have $a + s^2 < 0$. Let $a + s^2 = -2^r h$, where $r, h \in \mathbb{Z}_{\geq 0}$ and $2 \nmid h$. Assume that $p$ is a prime divisor of $h$. Then $p$ is odd. From (5), we have $a^3 \equiv t^2 \pmod{p}$. Therefore,

$$0 \equiv a^2(a + s^2) \equiv t^2 + (as)^2 \pmod{p}. \tag{6}$$

Since $p \mid a + s^2$, $b = 4s^2$, and $\gcd(a,b) = 1$, we have $p \nmid a$ and $p \nmid s$. From (6), we also have $p \nmid t$, hence $(-1|p) = 1$. Therefore, $p \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$. This holds for every prime divisor of $h$. By Lemma 1, we have $h = A^2 + B^2$, where $A, B \in \mathbb{Z}$.

- $2 \mid s$. Since $a \equiv 1 \pmod{8}$, we have $a + s^2 \equiv 1 \pmod{4}$. Since $a + s^2 = -2^r h$, we have $r = 0$ and $h \equiv -1 \pmod{4}$. Therefore,

  $$-1 \equiv h \equiv A^2 + B^2 \pmod{4},$$

  which is impossible since $A^2 + B^2 \equiv 0, 1, 2 \pmod{4}$.
- $2 \nmid s$. Since $a \equiv 1 \pmod{8}$, we have $a + s^2 \equiv 2 \pmod{8}$. Since $a + s^2 = -2^r h$, we have $r = 1$ and $h \equiv -1 \pmod{4}$. Therefore,

  $$-1 \equiv h \equiv A^2 + B^2 \pmod{4},$$

  which is impossible since $A^2 + B^2 \equiv 0, 1, 2 \pmod{4}$.

## References

[1] A. Bremner and R. K. Guy, Two more representation problems. *Proc. Edinburgh Math. Soc. (2)* **40** (1997), no. 1, 1–17

[2] E. Dofs, Solutions of $x^3 + y^3 + z^3 = nxyz$. *Acta Arith.* **73** (1995), no. 3, 201–213

[3] W. Sierpiński, *250 problems in elementary number theory*. Modern Anal. Computat. Meth. Sci. Math. 26, American Elsevier Publishing, New York, 1970

[4] J. H. Silverman, *A friendly introduction to number theory*. 4th edn., Pearson, London, 2012

Nguyen Xuan Tho
Hanoi University of Science and Technology
1, Dai Co Viet, Hanoi, Vietnam
tho.nguyenxuan1@hust.edu.vn